

Staff consultation summary: Internal Audit business case

Theme	Issue	Consultee	Consultee	Consultee	Consultee	Consultee	Consultee	Consultee
		UNISON co-ordinated (A. Gregson letter 17th December 2009)	UNISON Redditch branch letter received 21st December	UNISON Worcs City branch letter received 3rd December	GMB reponse re Internal Audit	Response from Bromsgrove DC Audit Team	WDC Audit comments on Business Case	WDC Senior Auditor
Staff/ union consultation process and timescale	Delay in providing Business Cases for comment	Delay in providing Business Cases for comment						
	Insufficient time for consultation on business cases	Insufficient time for consultation on business cases	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response					
	Reluctance to engage in early discussions with unions and others contrary to statutory advice on redundancy and change management	Reluctance to engage in early discussions with unions and others contrary to statutory advice on redundancy and change management						
	GMB (Worcester City Council) supports the WETT Programme Business Case for Internal Audit and makes the following comments and recommendations: GMB be invited to be present on all the Job Evaluation Panels for the WETT Programme. Compulsory redundancies be avoided wherever possible. Information on recognised Unions be made available to all staff in scope before their transfer. Pension impacts on staff in scope be made apparent in plain English and affected staff be signposted to external advice services. All support services in Worcester City Council be consulted in good time on the implementation of the shared services to allow them to adapt to the changes faced and reduce work-related stress, particularly in the light of the volume of work the shared service agenda presents to the Council. Emotional support services be in place for all staff involved to reduce				GMB (Worcester City Council) supports the WETT Programme Business Case for Internal Audit and makes the following comments and recommendations: GMB be invited to be present on all the Job Evaluation Panels for the WETT Programme. Compulsory redundancies be avoided wherever possible. Information on recognised Unions be made available to all staff in scope before their transfer. Pension impacts on staff in scope be made apparent in plain English and affected staff be signposted to external advice services. All support services in Worcester City Council be consulted in good time on the implementation of the shared services to allow them to adapt to the changes faced and reduce work-related stress, particularly in the light of the volume of work the shared service agenda presents to the Council. Emotional support services be in place for all staff involved to reduce incidences of work-related stress.			
	Request input to accommodation issue going forward					Request input to accommodation issue going forward		
	There were some concerns about unclear wording in the Business Case document leaving it open to different interpretations. Eg: Best practice methodology - badly worded; Vision - not really a vision.						There were some concerns about unclear wording in the Business Case document leaving it open to different interpretations. Eg: Best practice methodology - badly worded; Vision - not really a vision.	
	Inconsistencies in the Business Case were highlighted; e.g. regarding quality of service v savings							Inconsistencies in the Business Case were highlighted; e.g. regarding quality of service v savings
Structure and capacity	Lack of detail about structures making it difficult to comment on whether service will work or deliver improvements for local communities	Lack of detail about structures making it difficult to comment on whether service will work or deliver improvements for local communities						
	Lack of clarity that staffing levels will be sufficient to deliver the competences and statutory needs/ desired services	Lack of clarity that staffing levels will be sufficient to deliver the competences and statutory needs/ desired services				Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	
	Structure not very flat - 5 levels. How is this cost effective?	Structure not very flat - 5 levels. How is this cost effective?						
	The proposed structure is not very "flat" (5 levels if trainees are counted as a separate level). Why is this the case as it would not appear to be the most cost effective arrangement?		The proposed structure is not very "flat" (5 levels if trainees are counted as a separate level). Why is this the case as it would not appear to be the most cost effective arrangement?			Comments reflected in the UNISON Redditch branch response		

Staff consultation summary: Internal Audit business case

	Audit Sections within the County have cut staff in recent years and are already operating on minimum staffing levels. Therefore it is difficult to see how further savings on staff time can be achieved whilst still giving assurance on the systems of internal control to the Section 151 Officers (In Redditch's case it has not been able to complete its planned programme of Service Unit audits for the last two years because of the number of fraud/ad hoc investigations that have had to be carried out). The provision for contingency works in WIASS plan requires defining.		Audit Sections within the County have cut staff in recent years and are already operating on minimum staffing levels. Therefore it is difficult to see how further savings on staff time can be achieved whilst still giving assurance on the systems of internal control to the Section 151 Officers (In Redditch's case it has not been able to complete its planned programme of Service Unit audits for the last two years because of the number of fraud/ad hoc investigations that have had to be carried out). The provision for contingency works in WIASS plan requires defining.					
Impact on service delivery & performance	Professionals concern about achieving and delivering transformational change as proposed which is beyond merely a shared service	Professionals concern about achieving and delivering transformational change as proposed which is beyond merely a shared service					Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	
	We have concerns regarding the fact that it is anticipated that the shared service will generate savings by decreasing the total number of audit days required by each of the participating authorities. We feel that these savings are not achievable and will raise false expectations particularly in the early years of the shared service because of:- (a) staff having to get used to new auditing methods and systems; (b) the changing audit requirements in Redditch and Bromsgrove because of their proposed shared service arrangements for all services; (c) the changing audit requirements within the County because of the WETT programme of shared services. The detailed business case ASSUMES that the same level of audit assurance is provided despite the reduced number of days.		We have concerns regarding the fact that it is anticipated that the shared service will generate savings by decreasing the total number of audit days required by each of the participating authorities. We feel that these savings are not achievable and will raise false expectations particularly in the early years of the shared service because of:- (a) staff having to get used to new auditing methods and systems; (b) the changing audit requirements in Redditch and Bromsgrove because of their proposed shared service arrangements for all services; (c) the changing audit requirements within the County because of the WETT programme of shared services. The detailed business case ASSUMES that the same level of audit assurance is provided despite the reduced number of days.					Comments reflected in the UNISON Redditch branch response
	Concern is expressed over how the optional areas of work will be dealt with from Year 2 onwards as the Business Case states only these will be "subject of discussions with WIAS"		Concern is expressed over how the optional areas of work will be dealt with from Year 2 onwards as the Business Case states only these will be "subject of discussions with WIAS"					
						Assurance of quality - risk of management failure? Is the risk register accurate?		
Finance, savings and investment	Lack of detail to demonstrate service proposals are financially beneficial as not all services or costs are included	Lack of detail to demonstrate service proposals are financially beneficial as not all services or costs are included		Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response		Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	
	Little scope for savings from joined-up working and lack of details about how this will be done	Little scope for savings from joined-up working and lack of details about how this will be done						
	We have concerns surrounding the fact that Worcester City Council "generates 50% of its internal audit costs from completing work for other Authorities" in view of the contractor/client relationship in place for this work. If this income and therefore work is to be protected under the new arrangements then what will the status of this work be and will it be carried out on a "for profit basis"?		We have concerns surrounding the fact that Worcester City Council "generates 50% of its internal audit costs from completing work for other Authorities" in view of the contractor/client relationship in place for this work. If this income and therefore work is to be protected under the new arrangements then what will the status of this work be and will it be carried out on a "for profit basis"?				Comments reflect UNISON Redditch brancy response	Comments reflect UNISON Redditch brancy response

Staff consultation summary: Internal Audit business case

	There is an assumption in the Business Case that Wyre Forest D.C. will continue to purchase 100 days from Worcester City. Is this income guaranteed under a contract between the two authorities? and if the arrangement ceased would it impact on the viability of the shared service arrangement.		There is an assumption in the Business Case that Wyre Forest D.C. will continue to purchase 100 days from Worcester City. Is this income guaranteed under a contract between the two authorities? and if the arrangement ceased would it impact on the viability of the shared service arrangement.			Comments reflect UNISON Redditch brancy response		
	Support costs - how were these calculated for individual councils?					Support costs - how were these calculated for individual councils?		
ICT & technology	The Business Case states it is important to ensure that the various I.T. networks are compatible with each other. We have concerns that this issue will not be fully dealt with within the timescales available if this is not completed by the time the shared service begins it will significantly impact on audit productivity.		The Business Case states it is important to ensure that the various I.T. networks are compatible with each other. We have concerns that this issue will not be fully dealt with within the timescales available if this is not completed by the time the shared service begins it will significantly impact on audit productivity.					
	Concern about what happens if the £49 RIEP funding isn't received					Concern about what happens if the £49 RIEP funding isn't received		
	ICT equipment to support new structure - how will this work in practice?					ICT equipment to support new structure - how will this work in practice?		
	In effect are those authorities with low non-direct costs not subsidising those who are allowed to apply high non-direct costs?							In effect are those authorities with low non-direct costs not subsidising those who are allowed to apply high non-direct costs?
Impact on staff terms, conditions and career prospects	Adequacy of safeguards for employees facing relocation, reductions in pay or redundancy. Why have participating authorities not agreed a standard level of benefits / protection / assimilation for services subject to shared / partnership working, especially those being dealt with through the WETT process?	Adequacy of safeguards for employees facing relocation, reductions in pay or redundancy.						Why have participating authorities not agreed a standard level of benefits / protection / assimilation for services subject to shared / partnership working, especially those being dealt with through the WETT process?
	No evidence of intent to secure alternative employment across partner councils including vacancy freeze, redeployment, alternative work.	No evidence of intent to secure alternative employment across partner councils including vacancy freeze, redeployment, alternative work.						
	Honouring existing pay and grading mechanisms	Honouring existing pay and grading mechanisms		Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response				
	Proposed structure and ways of working stifle career progression resulting in difficulty in retaining staff	Proposed structure and ways of working stifle career progression resulting in difficulty in retaining staff	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response		Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response		
	Uncertainty leading to staff actively seeking alternative employment	Uncertainty leading to staff actively seeking alternative employment						
	How many staff are at risk through this proposal now and in the longer term? Neither Property nor IA specify which leaves a cloud of uncertainty over the services	How many staff are at risk through this proposal now and in the longer term? Neither Property nor IA specify which leaves a cloud of uncertainty over the services				Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response		
	Are there any issues concerning job grades, equal pay and so on?	Are there any issues concerning job grades, equal pay and so on?						
	What are the difficulties created by increased travel time and attendance at different locations? Are there significant personnel issues which could hinder the levels of delivery of service which is anticipated in the report?	What are the difficulties created by increased travel time and attendance at different locations? Are there significant personnel issues which could hinder the levels of delivery of service which is anticipated in the report?	Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response			Comments reflected in the UNISON co-ordinated response		

Staff consultation summary: Internal Audit business case

	Hot-desking is not necessarily a concept as well understood or practiced across all councils - there is a severe culture shock when moving to this pattern of working and, in most cases where it has been implemented, there is little evidence of support	Hot-desking is not necessarily a concept as well understood or practiced across all councils - there is a severe culture shock when moving to this pattern of working and, in most cases where it has been implemented, there is little evidence of support						
	Staff have concerns regarding the lack of information provided regarding: Worcester City Job Evaluation Scheme; Worcester City Terms and Conditions; the proposed scheme to Appoint and Assimilate staff.		Staff have concerns regarding the lack of information provided regarding: Worcester City Job Evaluation Scheme; Worcester City Terms and Conditions; the proposed scheme to Appoint and Assimilate staff.			Comments reflected in the UNISON Redditch branch response		Comments reflected in the UNISON Redditch branch response
	Has the working group managed to ensure a freeze on vacancies across the authorities? (not sure if this is to be internal & external)			Has the working group managed to ensure a freeze on vacancies across the authorities? (not sure if this is to be internal & external)				
	What will happen with regards to staff currently on a temporary contract (Revs & Bens staff on temp contracts were not renewed)			What will happen with regards to staff currently on a temporary contract (Revs & Bens staff on temp contracts were not renewed)				Comments reflect UNISON Worcs City branch response
	The trainee post will result in a position being made redundant – we have no trainee posts at the moment – make more sense to have a full trained staff structure.			The trainee post will result in a position being made redundant – we have no trainee posts at the moment – make more sense to have a full trained staff structure.				
	If just "Core" & "IT" audit is the main function after the 1 <sup>st</sup> year, what then will happen to staff with "Specialisms"? This may result in de-skilling staff.			If just "Core" & "IT" audit is the main function after the 1 <sup>st</sup> year, what then will happen to staff with "Specialisms"? This may result in de-skilling staff.				
	The reference to the pension rate being reduced is of concern, will there be an impact on those in the pension scheme?			The reference to the pension rate being reduced is of concern, will there be an impact on those in the pension scheme?				
	JDs and Person Specs: concern as to why these haven't already been assessed					JDs and Person Specs: concern as to why these haven't already been assessed		
	Concern about the professional qualifications needed for management positions - inconsistency across councils?					Concern about the professional qualifications needed for management positions - inconsistency across councils?		
	Will training commitments / flexible working arrangements by one authority be honoured by the host?					Will training commitments / flexible working arrangements by one authority be honoured by the host?		
Hosting proposals	What are the practicalities of a physical move to buildings already overstaffed with poor parking provision?	What are the practicalities of a physical move to buildings already overstaffed with poor parking provision?		Comments reflect UNISON co-ordinated response				
Governance	No details of joint trade union negotiation	No details of joint trade union negotiation						
	The different forms of governance for Property (and Internal Audit) should be more thoroughly examined, particularly key is the longevity of any SLA, how it is manufactured, monitored, and evaluated, as well as its flexibility	The different forms of governance for Property (and Internal Audit) should be more thoroughly examined, particularly key is the longevity of any SLA, how it is manufactured, monitored, and evaluated, as well as its flexibility						
	Why change from a JC to an SLA when this was the original suggestion by the working group. A JC seems to be better suited to this area.		Why change from a JC to an SLA when this was the original suggestion by the working group. A JC seems to be better suited to this area.				Comments reflect UNISON Redditch branch response	Comments reflect UNISON Redditch branch response
	IA not Two Tier, so why WETT?					IA not Two Tier, so why WETT?		
Equalities	No evidence of equality impact assessment	No evidence of equality impact assessment						